

Table 1. Vertical Analysis of TAM Theory

Authors (Year)	No. of Theory Elements	Number of Non-ATE	Number of ATE	Number of ATE by Type		
				I	II	III
Agarwal and Karahanna (2000)	7	1	6	6	6	6
Agarwal and Prasad (1998)*	4	-	4	4	-	-
Agarwal and Prasad (1999)	6	5	1	1	-	-
Agarwal et al. (2000)	4	2	2	2	-	-
Ahn et al. (2005)*	13	9	4	4	4	3
Amoako-Gyampah and Salam (2004)*	10	4	6	6	5	3
Bajaj and Nidumolu (1998)*	9	5	4	4	4	3
Bhattacharjee (2001a)*	5	-	5	5	3	2
Bhattacharjee (2001b)	5	-	5	5	5	1
Bhattacharjee and Sanford (2006)	9	7	2	2	-	-
Briggs et al. (1998)*	5	-	5	5	1	2
Brosnan (1999)*	19	11	8	8	-	-
Brown et al. (2010)	24	3	21	21	10	-
Castañeda et al. (2007)	8	8	-	-	-	-
Chakraborty et al. (2008)	8	5	3	3	2	1
Chan and Lu (2004)	10	3	7	7	5	-
Chan et al. (2010)	15	1	14	14	14	-
Chau (1996)*	4	2	2	2	2	2
Chau and Hu (2001)*	9	2	7	7	6	3
Chau and Hu (2002)*	15	1	14	14	14	6
Davis (1985)	7	3	4	4	2	2
Davis (1989)	2	-	2	2	2	2
De Guinea et al (2014)	6	2	4	4	-	-
Devaraj et al. (2002)*	4	1	3	3	3	-
Devaraj et al. (2008)	7	7	-	-	-	-
Dishaw and Strong (1999)*	14	7	7	7	5	3
Elwood et al. (2006)*	3	-	3	3	2	2
Fang et al. (2005-6)	12	5	7	7	7	-
Gefen and Straub (1997)	4	4	-	-	-	-
Gefen and Straub (2000)	5	2	3	3	-	-
Gefen (2003)*	6	3	3	3	2	2

Table 1. Vertical Analysis of TAM Theory

Authors (Year)	No. of Theory Elements	Number of Non-ATE	Number of ATE	Number of ATE by Type		
				I	II	III
Gefen et al. (2003)	12	4	8	8	4	3
Gentry and Calantone (2002)	3	1	2	2	-	-
Gong et al. (2004)	7	1	6	6	4	-
Hsu and Lu (2004)	12	1	11	11	10	4
Hsu and Lu (2007)	8	2	6	6	-	2
Hsu and Lin (2008)	11	-	11	11	7	2
Igbaria et al. (1995)	7	1	6	6	2	2
Igbaria et al. (1997)	14	11	3	3	4	4
Jackson et al. (1997)*	15	6	9	9	7	4
Kamis and Stohr (2006)	6	2	4	4	-	-
Karahanna et al. (2006)	17	4	13	13	13	3
Kim and Malhotra (2005)	16	14	2	2	1	1
Kim and Kankanhalli (2009)	11	3	8	8	8	-
Klopping and McKinney (2004)	9	1	8	8	4	2
Koufaris (2002)	19	3	16	16	2	5
Lederer et al. (2000)*	4	2	2	2	2	2
Li et al. (2005)	10	-	10	10	10	-
Lim (2003)*	6	-	6	6	2	-
Lu et al. (2003)	15	12	3	3	1	-
Lu et al. (2005)*	8	2	6	6	4	3
Lucas and Spitler (1999)*	7	4	3	3	3	2
Ma and Liu (2004)*	3	1	2	2	2	2
Mathieson (1991)*	15	3	12	12	12	3
McCloskey (2003)*	6	3	3	3	2	2
Ndubisi and Jantan (2003)	9	7	2	2	1	1
Ndubisi et al. (2005)	8	5	3	3	2	2
Pikkarainen et al. (2004)	6	2	4	4	2	2
Plouffe et al. (2001)*	10	1	9	9	5	4
Riemenschneider and Hardgrave (2001)*	4	4	-	-	-	-
Riemenschneider et al. (2003)*	15	2	13	13	13	4
Shih (2004)	8	2	6	6	1	1

Table 1. Vertical Analysis of TAM Theory

Authors (Year)	No. of Theory Elements	Number of Non-ATE	Number of ATE	Number of ATE by Type		
				I	II	III
Son et al. (2006)	8	3	5	5	5	-
Spacey et al. (2004)*	5	-	5	5	5	2
Srite and Karahanna (2006)	6	6	-	-	-	-
Taylor and Todd (1995a)*	27	4	23	23	20	5
Taylor and Todd (1995b)*	9	1	8	8	8	3
Venkatesh and Davis (1996)	6	4	2	2	-	-
Venkatesh (2000)*	9	5	4	4	2	2
Venkatesh and Morris (2000)	8	8	-	-	-	-
Venkatesh et al. (2002)	12	5	7	7	1	-
Venkatesh et al. (2003)	9	8	1	1	-	-
Vijayasarathy (2004)	9	-	9	9	7	3
Wang et al. (2003)	8	5	3	3	2	2
Wang et al. (2004)	6	1	5	5	5	3
Wang and Benbasat (2005)	6	3	3	3	3	2
Wixom and Todd (2005)*	19	2	17	17	-	-
Wu and Lederer (2009)	5	-	5	5	5	5
Xu et al. (2013)	7	-	7	7	7	-
Total (Percentage)	719 (100%)	262 (36.4%)	457 (63.6%)	457 (100%)	299 (65.4%)	127 (27.8%)

* The authors did not present their research hypotheses explicitly. The hypotheses are derived from figures in their paper.

REFERENCES

- Agarwal, R., and Karahanna, E. 2000. "Time Flies When You're Having Fun: Cognitive Absorption and Beliefs About Information Technology Usage," *MIS Quarterly* (24:4), pp. 665-694.
- Agarwal, R., and Prasad, J. 1998. "A conceptual and operational definition of personal innovativeness in the domain of information technology," *Information Systems Research* (9:2), pp. 204-215.
- Agarwal, R., and Prasad, J. 1999. "Are Individual Differences Germane to the Acceptance of New Information Technologies?," *Decision Sciences* (30:2), pp. 361-391.
- Agarwal, R., Sambamurthy, V., and Stair, R. M. 2000. "Research report: the evolving relationship between general and specific computer self-efficacy — an empirical assessment," *Information Systems Research* (11:4), pp. 418-430.
- Ahn, T., Ryu, S., and Han, I. 2005. "The impact of the online and offline features on the user acceptance of Internet shopping malls," *Electronic Commerce Research and Applications* (3:4), pp. 405-420.
- Amoako-Gyampah, K., and Salam, A. F. 2004. "An Extension of the Technology Acceptance Model in an ERP Implementation Environment," *Information and Management* (41:6), pp. 731-745.
- Bajaj, A., and Nidumolu, S. R. 1998. "A feedback model to understand information system usage," *Information & Management* (33:4), pp. 213-224.
- Bhattacharjee, A. 2001a. "An empirical analysis of the antecedents of electronic commerce service continuance," *Decision Support Systems* (32:2), pp. 201-214.
- Bhattacharjee, A. 2001b. "Understanding Information Systems Continuance: An Expectation-Confirmation Model," *MIS Quarterly* (25:3), pp. 351-370.
- Bhattacharjee, A., and Sanford, C. 2006. "Influence processes for information technology acceptance: An elaboration likelihood model," *MIS quarterly* (30:4) pp. 805-825.
- Briggs, R. O., Adkins, M., Mittleman, D., Kruse, J., Miller, S., and Nunamaker Jr, J. F. 1998. "A technology transition model derived from field investigation of GSS use aboard the USS Coronado," *Journal of Management Information Systems* (15:3) pp. 151-195.
- Brosnan, M. J. 1999. "Modeling Technophobia: A Case for Word Processing," *Computers in Human Behavior* (15:2), pp. 105-121.
- Brown, S. A., Dennis, A. R., and Venkatesh, V. 2010. "Predicting Collaboration Technology Use: Integrating Technology Adoption and Collaboration Research," *Journal of Management Information Systems* (27:2), pp. 9-53.
- Castañeda, J. A., Muñoz-Leiva, F., and Luque, T. 2007. "Web Acceptance Model (WAM): Moderating effects of user experience," *Information & Management* (44:4), pp. 384-396.
- Chakraborty, I., Hu, P. J. H., and Cui, D. 2008. "Examining the effects of cognitive style in individuals' technology use decision making," *Decision Support Systems* (45:2), pp. 228-241.
- Chan, S., and Lu, M. 2004. "Understanding Internet Banking Adoption and Use Behavior: A Hong Kong Perspective," *Journal of Global Information Management* (12:3), pp. 21-43.
- Chan, F. K. Y., Thong, J. Y. L., Venkatesh, V., Brown, S. A., Hu, J.-H., Tam, K. Y. 2010. "Modeling Citizen Satisfaction with Mandatory Adoption of an E-Government Technology," *Journal of the Association for Information Systems* (11:10), pp. 519-549.
- Chau, P. K. Y. 1996. "An Empirical Assessment of a Modified Technology Acceptance Model," *Journal of Management Information Systems* (13:2), pp. 185-204.
- Chau, P. Y. K., and Hu, P. J. 2001. "Information Technology Acceptance by Individual Professionals: A Model Comparison Approach," *Decision Sciences* (32:4), pp. 699-719.
- Chau, P. Y. K., and Hu, P. J. 2002. "Investigating Healthcare Professionals' Decisions to Accept Telemedicine Technology: An Empirical Test of Competing Theories," *Information and Management* (39:4), pp. 297-311.

- Davis, F. D. 1985. "A Technology Acceptance Model for Empirically Testing New End-User Information Systems: Theory and Results," (Doctoral dissertation, Sloan School of Management, Massachusetts Institute of Technology).
- Davis, F. D. 1989. "Perceived Usefulness, Perceived Ease of Use, and User Acceptance of Information Technology," *MIS Quarterly* (13:3), pp. 319-339.
- de Guinea, A. O., Titah, R., Léger, P.-M. 2014. "Explicit and Implicit Antecedents of Users' Behavioral Beliefs in Information Systems: A Neuropsychological Investigation," *Journal of Management Information Systems* (30:4), pp. 179-210.
- Devaraj, S., Fan, M., and Kohli, R. 2002. "Antecedents of B2C Channel Satisfaction and Preference: Validation E-Commerce Metrics," *Information Systems Research* (13:3), pp. 316-333.
- Devaraj, S., Easley, R. F., Crant, J. M. 2008. "How Does Personality Matter? Relating the Five-Factor Model to Technology Acceptance and Use," *Information Systems Research* (19:1), pp. 93-105.
- Dishaw, M. T., and Strong, D. M. 1999. "Extending the Technology Acceptance Model with Task-Technology Fit Constructs," *Information and Management* (36:1), pp. 9-21.
- Elwood, S., Changchit, C. and Cutshall, R. 2006. "Investigating Students' Perceptions on Laptop Initiative in Higher Education: An Extension of the Technology Acceptance Model," *Campus Wide Information Systems* (23:5), pp. 336-349.
- Fang, X., Chan, S., Brzezinski, J., Xu, S. 2005/2006, "Moderating Effects of Task Type on Wireless Technology Acceptance," *Journal of Management Information Systems* (22:3), pp. 123-157.
- Gefen, D., and Straub, D. W. 1997. "Gender Differences in the Perception and Use of E-mail: An Extension to the Technology Acceptance Model," *MIS Quarterly* (21:4), pp. 389-400.
- Gefen, D., and Straub, D. W. 2000. "The Relative Importance of Perceived Ease of Use in IS Adoption: A Study of E-Commerce Adoption," *Journal of the Association for Information Systems* (1:8), pp. 1-28.
- Gefen, D. 2003. "TAM or Just Plain Habit: A Look at Experienced Online Shoppers," *Journal of End User Computing* (15:3), pp. 1-13.
- Gefen, D., Karahanna, E., and Straub, D. W. 2003. "Trust and TAM in Online Shopping: An Integrated Model," *MIS Quarterly* (27:1), pp. 51-90.
- Gentry, L., and Calantone, R. 2002. "A Comparison of Three Models to Explain Shop-bot Use on the Web," *Psychology and Marketing* (19:11), pp. 945-955.
- Gong, M., Xu, Y., and Yu, Y. 2004. "An Enhanced Technology Acceptance Model for Web-based Learning," *Journal of Information Systems Education* (15:4), pp. 365-374.
- Hsu, C. L. and Lu, H. P. 2004. "Why Do People Play On-line Games? An Extended TAM with Social Influences and Flow Experience," *Information and Management* (41:7), pp. 853-868.
- Hsu, C. L. and Lu, H. P. 2007. "Consumer Behavior in On-line Game Communities: A Motivational Factor Perspective," *Computers in Human Behavior* (23:3), pp. 1642-1659.
- Hsu, C. L. and Lin, J. C. 2008. "Acceptance of Blog Usage: The Roles of Technology Acceptance, Social Influence and Knowledge Sharing Motivation," *Information and Management* (45:1), pp. 65-74.
- Igbaria, M., Guimaraes, T., and Davis, G. B. 1995. "Testing the Determinants of Microcomputer Usage via a Structural Equation Model," *Journal of Management Information Systems* (11:4), pp. 87-114.
- Igbaria, M., Zinatelli, N., Cragg, P., and Cavaye, A. L. M. 1997. "Personal Computing Acceptance Factors in Small Firms: A Structural Equation Model," *MIS Quarterly* (21:3), pp. 279-305.
- Jackson, C. M., Chow, S., and Leitch, R. A. 1997. "Toward an Understanding of the Behavioral Intention to Use an Information System," *Decision Sciences* (28:2), pp. 357-389.
- Kamis, A. and Stohr, E. 2006. "Parametric Search Engines: What Makes them Effective when Shopping Online for Differentiated Products?" *Information and Management* (43:7): pp. 904-918.

- Karahanna, E., Agarwal, R., Angst, C. M. 2006. "Reconceptualizing Compatibility Beliefs in Technology Acceptance Research," *MIS Quarterly* (30: 4), pp. 781-804.
- Kim, S. S., and Malhotra, N. K. 2005. "A Longitudinal Model of Continued IS Use: An Integrative View of Four Mechanisms Underlying Post adoption Phenomena," *Management Science* (51:5), pp. 741-755.
- Kim, H.-W., Kankanhalli, A. 2009. "Investigating User Resistance to Information Systems Implementation: A Status Quo Bias Perspective," *MIS Quarterly* (33:3), pp. 567-582.
- Klopping, I. M., and McKinney, E. 2004. "Extending the Technology Acceptance Model and the Task-technology Fit Model to Consumer E-commerce," *Information Technology, Learning, and Performance Journal* (22:1), pp.35-48.
- Koufaris, M. 2002. "Applying the Technology Acceptance Model and Flow Theory to Online Consumer Behavior," *Information Systems Research* (13:2), pp. 205-223.
- Lederer, A. L., Maupin, D. J., Sena, M. P., and Zhuang, Y. 2000. "The Technology Acceptance Model and the World Wide Web," *Decision Support Systems* (29:3), pp. 269-282.
- Li, D., Chua, P. Y. K., Hao L., "Understanding Individual Adoption of Instant Messaging: An Empirical Investigation," *Journal of the Association for Information Systems* (6:4), pp. 102-129.
- Lim, J. 2003. "A Conceptual Framework on the Adoption of Negotiation Support Systems," *Information and Software Technology* (45:8), pp. 469-477.
- Lu, J., Yu, C. S., Liu, C., & Yao, J. E. 2003. "Technology Acceptance Model for Wireless Internet," *Internet Research*, (13:3), pp. 206-222.
- Lu, H., Hsu, C., and Hsu, H. 2005. "An Empirical Study of the Effect of Perceived Risk upon Intention to Use Online Applications," *Information Management and Computer Security* (13:2/3), pp. 106-120.
- Lucas, H. C. Jr, and Spitler, V. K. 1999. "Technology Use and Performance: A Field Study of Broker Workstations," *Decision Sciences* (30:2), pp. 291-311.
- Ma, Q., and Liu, L. 2004. "The Technology Acceptance Model: A Meta-analysis of Empirical Findings," *Journal of Organizational and End User Computing* (16:1), pp. 59-72.
- Mathieson, K. 1991. "Predicting User Intentions: Comparing the Technology Acceptance Model with the Theory of Planned Behavior," *Information Systems Research* (2:3), pp. 173-191.
- McCloskey, D. 2003. "Evaluating Electronic Commerce Acceptance with the Technology Acceptance Model," *The Journal of Computer Information Systems* (44:2), pp. 49-57.
- Ndubisi, N. O., and Jantan, M. 2003. "Evaluating IS Usage in Malaysian Small and Medium-sized Firms Using the Technology Acceptance Model," *Logistics Information Management* (16:6), pp. 440-450.
- Ndubisi, N. O., Gupta, O. K., and Ndubisi, G. C. 2005. "The Moguls' Model of Computing: Integrating the Moderating Impact of Users' Persona into the Technology Acceptance Model," *Journal of Global Information Technology Management* (8:1), pp. 27-47.
- Pikkarainen, T., Pikkarainen, K., Karjaluoto, H., and Pahlila, S. 2004. "Consumer Acceptance of Online Banking: An Extension of the Technology Acceptance Model," *Internet Research* (14:3), pp. 224-235.
- Plouffe, C. R., Hulland, J. S., and Vandenbosch, M. 2001. "Research Report: Richness versus Parsimony in Modeling Technology Adoption Decisions - Understanding Merchant Adoption of a Smart Card-based Payment System," *Information Systems Research* (12:2), pp. 208-222.
- Riemenschneider, C. K., and Hardgrave, B. C. 2001. "Explaining Software Development Tool Use with the Technology Acceptance Model," *The Journal of Computer Information Systems* (41:4), pp. 1-8.
- Riemenschneider, C. K., Harrison, D. A., and Mykytn, P. P., Jr. 2003. "Understanding IT Adoption Decisions in Small Business: Integrating Current Theories," *Information and Management* (40:4), pp. 269-285.
- Son., J.-Y., Kim, S. S., Riggins, F. J. 2006. "Consumer Adoption of Net-Enabled Infomediaries: Theoretical Explanations and an Empirical Test," *Journal of the Association for Information Systems* (7:7), pp. 473-508.

- Shih, H. 2004. "Extended Technology Acceptance Model of Internet Utilization Behavior," *Information and Management* (41:6), pp. 719-729.
- Spacey, R., Goulding, A., and Murray, I. 2004. "Exploring the Attitudes of Public Library Staff to the Internet Using the TAM," *Journal of Documentation* (60:5), pp. 550-564.
- Srite, M., Karahanna, E. 2006. "The Role of Sepoused National Cultural Values in Technology Acceptance," *MIS Quarterly* (30:3), pp. 679-704.
- Taylor, S., and Todd, P. A. 1995a. "Understanding Information Technology Usage: A Test of Competing Models," *Information Systems Research* (6:2), pp. 144-176.
- Taylor, S., and Todd, P. A. 1995b. "Assessing IT usage: The role of prior experience," *MIS quarterly* (19:4), pp. 561-570.
- Venkatesh, V., and Davis, F. D. 1996. "A Model of the Antecedents of Perceived Ease of Use: Development and Test," *Decision Sciences* (27:3), pp. 451-481.
- Venkatesh, V. 2000. "Determinants of Perceived Ease of Use: Integrating Control, Intrinsic Motivation, and Emotion into the Technology Acceptance Model," *Information Systems Research* (11:4), pp. 342-365.
- Venkatesh, V., and Morris, M. G. 2000. "Why Don't Men ever Stop to Ask for Directions? Gender, Social influence, and Their Role in Technology Acceptance and Usage Behavior," *MIS Quarterly* (24:1), pp. 115-139.
- Venkatesh, V., Speier, C., and Morris, M. G. 2002. "User Acceptance Enablers in Individual Decision Making about Technology: Toward an Integrated Model," *Decision Sciences* (33:2), pp. 297-316.
- Venkatesh, V., Morris, M. G., Davis, G. B., and Davis, F. D. 2003. "User Acceptance of Information Technology: Toward a Unified View," *MIS Quarterly* (27:3), pp. 425-478.
- Vijayasarathy, L. R. 2004. "Predicting Consumer Intentions to Use On-line Shopping: The Case for an Augmented Technology Acceptance Model," *Information and Management* (41:6), pp. 747-762.
- Wang, Y., Wang, Y., Lin, H., and Tang, T. 2003. "Determinants of User Acceptance of Internet Banking: An Empirical Study," *International Journal of Service Industry Management* (14:5), pp. 501-519.
- Wang, C., Hsu, Y., and Fang, W. 2004. "Acceptance of Technology with Network Externalities: An Empirical Study of Internet Instant Messaging Services," *Journal of Information Technology Theory and Application* (6:4), pp. 15-28.
- Wang, W., and Benbasat, I. 2005. "Trust in and Adoption of Online Recommendation Agents," *Journal of the Association for Information Systems* (6:3), pp. 72-101.
- Wixom, B. H., and Todd, P. A. 2005. "A Theoretical Integration of User Satisfaction and Technology Acceptance," *Information Systems Research* (16:1), pp. 85-102.
- Wu, J. and Lederer, A., 2009. "A Meta-Analysis of the Role of Environment-based Voluntariness in Information Technology Acceptance," *MIS Quarterly* (33:2), pp.419-441.
- Xu, J., Benbasat, I., Cenfetelli, R. T., "Integrating Service Quality with System and Information Quality: An Empirical Test in the e-Service Context," *MIS Quarterly* (37:3), pp.777-A9.